

Training packages for health professionals to improve access and quality of health services for migrants and ethnic minorities, including the Roma

MODULE 4: KNOWLEDGE APPLICATION

Unit 1: Strategies and Procedures for People-Centered Health Care Services Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

> Elaborated by: Amets Suess, Andalusian School of Public Health, 2015

Outline of the Session

- Activity: Video Screening and Discussion.
- Presentation:
 - ✓ People-Centered Health Care: Concept and Principles.
 - People-Centered Approaches in Health Care Oriented Towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity.
 - People-Centered Health Care Oriented Towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity: Related Frameworks.

Activity 1: Health Care Focused on Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

Please watch the following video:



"Two blue crocodiles and the gap in the system" IGIV, Implementation Guidelines for Intersectional Peer Violence Preventive Work, Education and Culture Lifelong Learning Programme, 2011. <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=byRjVKsM140</u>



- Group discussion (in plenary), including the following aspects:
 - ✓ Do you think the situation described in the video could happen in your own country / regional context?
 - What advantages and limitations can you identify in culture- and ethnic-specific health care services, in self-organized health care services or in health care services oriented towards cultural and ethnic diversity and reduction of health inequalities?
 - \checkmark Do you think it could be useful to work with a mixed model?
 - ✓ Which model do you think is most adequate in your country / regional context? Which adaptation would be necessary to implement it?

People-Centered Health Care: Concept

The overall vision for **people-centred health care** is one in which individuals, families and communities are **served by** and **are able to participate** in trusted health systems that respond to their needs in **humane and holistic ways**. The health system is designed around **stakeholder needs** and enables individuals, families and communities to **collaborate** with health practitioners and health care organizations in the public, private and not-for-profit health and related sectors in driving improvements in the quality and responsiveness of health care.

People-centred health care is rooted in universally held values and principles which are enshrined in international law, such as human rights and dignity, nondiscrimination, participation and empowerment, access and equity, and a partnership of equals. (WHO-WPRO 2007: 7)

People-Centered Health Care: Terms

- Person-centered health care
- Patient-centered health care.
- People-centered health care.



 \implies Preference for "people-centered health care" as the most inclusive term.

People-Centered Health Care: Principles

Culture of care and communication

- Informed Decision Making.
- Respect for privacy and dignity.
- Response to needs in a holistic manner.

• Responsible, responsive and accountable services

- Accessibility.
- Affordability.
- Ethics.

• Supportive health care environments

- Strong primary care services.
- Stakeholders' involvement in health services planning, policy development and quality improvement.



Participation in decision making Health literacy Self-management Self care Community participation

Comfortable environment Coordination Multidisciplinary teams Patient education Standards for quality, safe and ethical services Models of care Leadership

People-Centered Health Care: Domains for Development

People-

Centered

Health Care

Holistic care Quality, safe and ethical services

Individuals, families and communities

Health Care

Organizations

Health Practitioners

Health

Systems

Strengthening Primary Care Improving access Strong evidence base Rational technology use Accountability Professional standards Monitoring health care quality

WHO-WPRO 2007; Figure: own elaboration.

People-Centered Approaches in Health Care for Migrants and Ethnic Minorities

• Diversity of migration and ethnic experiences.



- Frequent situation of social vulnerability.
 - ⇒ Relevance of a people-centered approach in health care for migrants and ethnic minorities.

People-Centered Approaches in Health Care for Migrants and Ethnic Minorities



Concepts: Patient-centeredness and cultural competence

• Effectiveness of cultural competence programmes in patient-centered health care for migrants and ethnic minorities

Conceptual Shifts:

People-Centered Approaches in Health Care for Migrants and Ethnic Minorities

Cultural competence: Focus on culturally specific habits, belief and needs \rightarrow Health policies focused on providing specialized health care services for migrants and ethnic minorities.

Intercultural competence: Focus on the dynamics of interaction between different cultures
→ Health policies focused on addressing health care needs in intercultural contexts.

 $\mathbf{\Psi}$

Cultural diversity: Focus on the recognition of diversity as a positive social contribution \rightarrow Health policies focused on addressing health care needs from a diversity perspective.

Cultural sensitivity / Difference sensitivity / Diversity sensitivity: Focus on the awareness of diversity and intersectional character of social inequalities \rightarrow Health policies focused on reducing transversal and interconnected social inequalities.

People-Centered Approaches in Health Care of Migrants and Ethnic Minorities

Cultural competence → intercultural competence → cultural diversity → cultural sensitivity / difference sensitivity / diversity sensitivity

 Health care addressed to specific cultural and ethnic groups → health care with focus on social inequalities, social determinants of health and intersectionalities

• Patient-centered health care \rightarrow people-centered health care

 \Rightarrow People-centered health care oriented to cultural and ethnic diversity

 \Rightarrow Diversity-sensitive people-centered health care

Health Care for Migrant and Ethnic Minorities: Policies Levels

International Human Rights and Strategic Framework



Figure: Own elaboration.

People-Centered Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity: Related Frameworks

Human Rights Framework

Social Determinants of Health

Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics People-Centered Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

Intersectionality

Community Participation Intersectorality

Figure: Own elaboration.

International and European Human Rights Framework: Migrants and Ethnic Minorities

Large number of international and European strategic documents.

- Differences:
 - ✓ Geographic scope
 - ✓ Format
 - Legally binding status
 - Population group



FRA 2011; Mock-Muñoz de Luna et al. 2015a, 2015b; Suess et al. 2014; WHO-WPRO 2014.

International Human Rights Framework: Accessibility and Quality of Health Care

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, ONU 1966 [1976]

Art. 12.1.: The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.



International Human Rights Framework: Accessibility and Quality of Health Care

Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment Nº 14, The right to the highest attainable standard of health

• Health as a fundamental human right, *"closely related to and interdependent upon the realization of other human rights".*

- Essential elements:
 - ✓ Availability
 - ✓ Accessibility
 - ✓ Acceptability
 - ✓ Quality

International Human Rights Framework: Accessibility and Quality of Health Care

Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment Nº 14, The right to the highest attainable standard of health

• Awareness of the constraints to the full realization of the right to health, due to the limits of available resources.

• Principle of progressive realization of the right to health.

• Retrogressive measures are not permissible; in case of being taken, only *"after the most careful consideration of all alternatives"*.

In particular, States are under the obligation to respect the right to health by, inter alia, **refraining from denying or limiting equal access for all persons**, including prisoners or detainees, **minorities**, **asylum seekers and illegal immigrants**, to preventive, curative and palliative health services; abstaining from enforcing discriminatory practices as a State policy; and abstaining from imposing discriminatory practices relating to women's health status and needs. (CESCR 2000: 10)

International and European Human Rights Framework: Examples of Strategic Documents Focused on Migrants or Ethnic Minorities

• Examples of strategic documents focused on migrant populations

✓ International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, 1990.

Resolution WHA 61.17 Health of Migrants, 2008.

• Examples of strategic documents focused on ethnic minorities

✓ International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 [1969].

✓ Council of the European Union. EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies (NRIS), 2011.



International and European Human Rights Framework Implementation in Health Policies oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

Recent comparative studies in the European context:

Uneven fulfillment of the right to health and right to health care for migrants in an 'irregular' situation across Europe.

 Barriers in accessing and utilizing health care services for ethnic minorities, including experiences of discrimination, denial or exclusion from health care.

Limitations due to the frequent lack of legally binding character or ratification of international treaties.

Biswas, et al. 2011; Council of Europe 2012; Cuadra 2011; Dauvrin, et al. 2012; DHSSPS 2007; Duvell, et al. 2009; FRA, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights 2011a, 2011b, 2012; HUMA Network, et al. 2010; Karl-Trummer et al. 2010; Médicins du Monde, et al. 2009, 2012, 2013; PICUM, et al. 2014; Ruiz-Casares, et al. 2010; Suess et al. 2014; Woodward, et al. 2014. International and European Human Rights Framework Implementation in Health Policies oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

Recent comparative studies in the European context:

- Identification of the Human Rights perspective as an important framework for improving access to health care for migrants and ethnic minorities.
- Recommendation of implementing policies and interventions addressed to providing access to health care for all people living in Europe, regardless of nationality, administrative status and ethnicity, as well as eliminating barriers to effective access to health care.

Biswas, et al. 2011; Council of Europe 2012; Cuadra 2011; Dauvrin, et al. 2012; DHSSPS 2007; Duvell, et al. 2009; FRA, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights 2011a, 2011b, 2012; HUMA Network, et al. 2010; Karl-Trummer et al. 2010; Médicins du Monde, et al. 2009, 2012, 2013; PICUM, et al. 2014; Ruiz-Casares, et al. 2010; Suess et al. 2014; Woodward, et al. 2014.

Social Determinants of Health



WHO 2008; 2010a; Figure: WHO 2010a:48.

Policy Measures to Tackle Social Determinants of Health: Migrants and Ethnic Minorities



Dahlgren, et al. 1991; WHO 2010. Figure: WHO 2010: 14, adapted from: Dahlgren, et al. 1991.

Social Determinants of Health Framework Applied to Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

• Analysis of an impact of social determinants of health on the health of migrants and ethnic minorities.

• Observation of a tendency to reduce social determinants of health to socioeconomic factors, without taking into account migration background or ethnicity, or viceversa, to reduce social inequalities to cultural and ethnic aspects.



Fésüs et al. 2012, Hajduchová et al. 2014; Ingleby 2012; Marmot et al. 2012.

Social Determinants of Health Framework Applied to Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

- Proposed policies:
 - ✓ Relevance of action on the social determinants of health to achieve greater health equity.
 - ✓ Importance of addressing processes of exclusion rather than focusing on the characteristics of excluded groups, including migrants or ethnic minorities.
 - Relevance of aligning health policies focused on reducing health inequalities with education, economic, labour, housing and environmental policies.
 - Relevance of integrated, intersectional, multivariate and multilevel approaches to tackle health inequities.



Fésüs et al. 2012, Hajduchová et al. 2014; Ingleby 2012; Marmot et al. 2012.

Intersectionality

in People-Centered Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

 Relevance of intersectional approaches for people-centered health care oriented towards cultural and ethnic diversity.



Acevedo-García, et al. 2012; Aspinall, et al. 2013; Bauer 2014; Cattacin, et al. 2013; Gazard et a. 2014; Hankivsky (ed) 2011; Kovandžić, et al. 2012; Roberston 2014; Rosenfield 2012; Seng, et al. 2012; Sears 2012; Van Laer, et al. 2014; Viruell Fuentes et al. 2012; figure: own elaboration.

Intersectorality

in People-Centered Health Care Oriented towards Cultural and Ethnic Diversity

 Relevance of intersectoral collaboration for people-centered health care oriented towards cultural and ethnic diversity.



Community Participation

- Relevance of **community participation** for diversity sensitive people-centered health care.
- Experiences of migrants' and ethnic minorities' participation in health policies on different levels.



Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics

 Relevance of a specific reflection on ethical aspects and deontological principles in people-centered health care and research oriented towards cultural and ethnic diversity.

- Intercultural and diversity-sensitive ethics
 - ✓ Health care organization
 - ✓ Health care practice
 - ✓ Health research



Berlinger et al. 2013; Bhopal 2008; Bostick et al. 2006; Dwyer 2004; Duvell, et al. 2008; Eckwiler et al. 2012; European Roma Rights Centre 2006; Marshall, et al. 2004; NHS Greater Glasgow et al. 2004; Pechurina 2014; Van Liempt et al. 2009, Wild 2011.

Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics in Health Care Organization

- Within the four main bioethical principles developed by Beauchaump and Childress (2012 [1979]): specific focus on the principle of justice.
 - ✓ Migrants: Limitation of health care entitlements as a contradiction with the principle of non discrimination and social responsibility.
 - ✓ Ethnic minorities: Fulfilment of the principle of non discrimination and cultural acceptability.



Beauchaump et al. (2012 [1979]); Dwyer 2004; Duvell, et al. 2008; Eckwiler et al. 2012; European Centre for Roma Rights 2006; Wild 2011.

Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics in Health Care Practice

•Ethical aspects in health care for migrants

- Importance of reducing legal, structural, linguistic and cultural barriers in the access to health care.
- ✓ Relevance of an adequate intercultural competence.
- Ethical conflicts in age assessment procedures and in relation to legal regulations.

•Ethical aspects in health care for ethnic minorities

- Ethical responsibility of reducing health care disparities and addressing the needs and preferences of ethnic minorities.
- ✓ Importance of applying medical ethical codes of conduct.
- \checkmark Relevance of increasing the ethnic diversity within the professional field.

Berlinger et al. 2013; Bostick et al. 2006; European Roma Rights Centre 2006; Wild 2011.

Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics in Research



- Research with migrants
 - ✓ Limitation of informed consent procedures in multilingual contexts.
 - Contradiction between an analysis of cultural differences and the duty of nondiscrimination.
 - ✓ Risk of abuse due to a specific situation of vulnerability.
 - ✓ Importance of guaranteeing confidentiality and privacy.
 - ✓ Relevance of intercultural communication and ethical sensitivity.
 - ✓ Need for taking into account the potential impact of a re-narration of traumatic experiences.
 - ✓ Potential ethical conflicts in research with migrants in an 'irregular' situation.
 - ✓ Relevance of participatory approaches.
 - ✓ Reflections on the social position, cultural background, identity and role of the researcher, insider/outsider role and power relationships.

Intercultural and Diversity-Sensitive Ethics in Research



•Research with ethnic minorities

- ✓ Relevance of **understanding the culture and needs** of the ethnic minority community.
- ✓ Importance of using appropriate and culturally sensitive methodologies.
- ✓ Relevance of guaranteeing confidentiality and privacy.
- ✓ Critical review of terminologies and categorization processes.
- ✓ Consideration of the potential impact of sensitive topics on the community.
- ✓ Active involvement of the ethnic minority community in the research design and process.
- Importance of facilitating a dissemination of the results in the involved communities.



Pictures: Andalusian Childhood Observatory (OIA, Observatorio de la Infancia de Andalucía) 2014; Josefa Marín Vega 2014; RedIsir 2014; Morguefile 2014.

Acevedo-García D, Sanchez Vaznaugh EV, Viruell-Fuentes EA, Almeida J. Integrating social epidemiology into immigrant health research: A cross-national framework. Social Science & Medicine 2012;75(12):2060-2068.

Arnstein SR. A Ladder of Citizen Participation. JAIP 1969;35(4):216 – 224.

Aspinall PJ, Song M. Is race a 'salient...' or 'dominant identity' in the early 21st century: The evidence of UK survey data no respondents' sense of who they are. Social Science Research 2013;42(2):547-561.

Bauer GR. Incorporating intersectionality theory into population health research methodology: Challenges and the potential to advance health equity. Social Science & Medicine 2014;110:10-17.

Beach MC, Saha S, Cooper LA. The role and relationship of cultural competence and patient-centeredness in health care quality. New York, Washington: The Commonwhealth Fund, 2006.

Beauchamp TL, Childress JF. Principles of Biomedical Ethics. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012 [1979].

Berlinger N, Raghavan R. The Ethics of Advocacy for Undocumented Patients. Hastings Center Report 2013;431):14-17.

Bhopal R. Ethical Issues in Health Research on Ethnic Minority Populations: Focusing on Inclusion and Exclusion. Research Ethics 2008;4(1):15-19.

Bischoff A. Caring for migrant and minority patients in European hospitals. A review of effective interventions. MFH – Migrant Friendly Hospitals, a European initiative to promote health and health literacy for migrants and ethnic minorities. Neuchâtel, Basel: MFH, 2003.

http://mfh-eu.univie.ac.at/public/files/mfh_literature_review.pdf (reviewed: December 16, 2014).

Biswas D, Toebes B, Hjern A, Ascher H, Norredam M. Access to health care for undocumented migrants from a human rights perspective: a comparative study of Denmark, Sweden, and the Netherlands. Health and Human Rights 2012;14:2:49-60.

Bostick N, Morin K, Benjamin R, Higginson D. Physicians' ethical responsibilities in addressing racial and ethnic healthcare disparities. J Natl Med Assoc 2006;98(8):1329-1334.

CECSR, Committee on Economic, Cultural and Social Rights. General Comment N° 14 (2000). The right to the highest attainable standard of health, p. 1-4. <u>http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/TBSearch.aspx?Lang=en&TreatyID=9&DocTypeID=11</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Cattacin S, Chiarenza A, Domenig D. Equity standards for healthcare organisations: a theoretical framework. Diversity and Equality in Health and Care 2013;10:249-258.

Chiarenza A. Developments in the concept of 'cultural competence'- In: Ingleby D, Chiarenza A, Devillé W, Kotsioni I (eds). Inequalities in health care for migrants and ethnic minorities, Vol. 2, p. 66-81. COST Series on Health and Diversity. Antwerp: Garant Publishers, 2012.

Cornwall, A. (2008). Unpacking 'Participation': modes, meanings and practices. Community Development Journal 43(3):269-283.

Council of Europe, Comissioner for Human Rights. Human rights of Roma and Travellers in Europe. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 2012.

http://www.coe.int/t/commissioner/source/prems/prems79611_GBR_CouvHumanRightsOfRoma_WEB.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Council of Europe. Recommendation Rec2006(18) of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on health services in a multicultural society. <u>https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=1062769&BackC</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Council of the European Union. EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies (NRIS), 2011.

http://register.consilium.europa.eu/doc/srv?I=EN&f=ST%2010658%202011%20INIT (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Cuadra BC. Right of access to health care for undocumented migrants in EU: a comparative study of national policies. Eur J Public Health 2011;22:267–271.

Dauvrin M, Lorant V, Sandhu S, et al. Health care for irregular migrants: pragmatism across Europe. A qualitative study. BMC Res Notes 2012;5:99.

Dahlgren G, Whitehead M. Policies and strategies to promote social equity in health. Stockholm: Institute for Future Studies, 1991.

DHSSPS, Department of Health, Social Services and Public Safety. DHSSPS Equality and Human Rights Strategy and Action Plan. Section 3. Ethnicity, Equality & Human Rights: Access to Health and Social Services in Northern Ireland. 2007. <u>http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/ehr-sect3.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015). Duvell F, Triandafyllidou A, Vollmer B. Ethical issues in irregular migration research. Report on Ethical Issues, Deliverable D2 prepared for Work Package 2 of the research project CLANDESTINO Undocumented Migration: Counting the Uncountable. Data and Trends Across Europe, funded by the 6th Framework Programme for Research and Technological Development Research DG, European Commission, 2008.

http://irregular-

<u>migration.net/typo3_upload/groups/31/4.Background_Information/4.1.Methodology/EthicalIssuesIrregularMigration_Clandestino_Report_Nov09.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Dwyer J. Illegal Immigrants, Health Care, and Social Responsibility. Hasting Center Report 2004:34-41.

Eckenwiler L, Straehle C, Chung R. Global Solidarity, Migration and Global Health Inequity. Bioethics 2012;26(7):382-390.

European Roma Rights Centre. Ambulance not on the way. The Disgrace of Health Care for Roma in Europe. Budapest: European Roma Rights Centre, 2006. <u>http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/media/01/E6/m000001E6.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Fésüs G, Östlin P, McKee M, Ádány R. Policies to improve the health and well-being of Roma people: The European experience. Health Policy 2012;105:25-32.

FRA, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. Fundamental Rights of Migrants in an Irregular Situation in the European Union. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2011.

http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/1827-FRA_2011_Migrants_in_an_irregular_situation_EN.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015)

FRA, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. Migrants in an Irregular Situation: Access to Health Care in 10 European Union Member States. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2011b.

http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/1771-FRA-2011-fundamental-rights-for-irregular-migrants-healthcare_EN.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

FRA, European Union Fundamental Rights Agency, UNDP, United Nations Development Programme. The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States. Survey results at a glance. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2012.

http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/2009-FRA-2012-Roma-at-a-glance_FN_pdf (retrieved: March 5_2015)

Gazard B, Frissa C, Nellums L, Hotopf M, Hatach SL. Challenges in researching migration status, health and health service use: an intersectional analysis of a South London community. Ethnicity and Health 2014. DOI: 10.1080/13557858.2014.961410.

Hajduchová H, Urban D. Social determinants of health in the Romani population. Kontakt 2014;16:e39-e43.

Hankivsky O (ed). Health Inequities in Canada: Intersectional Frameworks and Practices. Vancouver, Toronto: UBC Press, 2011. <u>http://www.ubcpress.ca/books/pdf/chapters/2011/HealthInequitiesInCanada.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

HUMA Network, Health for Undocumented Migrants and Asylum Seekers, Collantes S. Are Undocumented Migrants and Asylum Seekers Entitled to Access Health Care in the EU? A Comparative Overview in 16 Countries. Paris, Brussels, Madrid: HUMA Network, 2010.

http://www.epim.info/wp-content/uploads/2011/02/HUMA-Publication-Comparative-Overview-16-Countries-2010.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Ingleby D. Ethnicity, Migration and the 'Social Determinants of Health' Agenda. Psychosocial Intervention 2012;21(3):331-341.

IOM, International Organization for Migration, WHO, World Health Organization; UNHRC, United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner. International Migration, Health and Human Rights. Geneva: IOM, 2013.

http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Migration/WHO_IOM_UNOHCHRPublication.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Karl-Trummer U, Novak-Zezula S. Health Care in Nowhereland, Improving Services for Undocumented Migrants in the EU. Vienna: Centre for Health and Migration, 2010.

Koitzsch Jensen N, Johansen KS, Kastrup M, Krasnik A, Morredam M. Patient Experienced Continuity of Care in the Psychiatric Healthcare System – A Study Including Immigrants, Refugees and Ethnic Danes. Int J Environ Res Public Health 2014;11:9739-9759.

Kovandžić M, Funnell E, Hammond J, Ahmed A, Edwards S, Clarke P, et al. The space of access to primary mental health care: A qualitative case study. Health & Place 2012;18(3):536-551.

Lood Q, Ivanoff SD, Dellenborg L, Mårtensson L. Health-promotion in the context of ageing and migration: a call for person-centred integrated practice. International Journal of Integrated Care 2014. <u>URN:NBN:NL:UI:10-1-114771</u>

Marmot M, Allan J, Bell R, Bloomer E, Goldblatt P, on behalf of the Consortium for the European Review of Social Determinants of Health and the Health Divide. WHO European review of social determinants of health and the health divide. Lancet 2012;380(15):1011-1029.

Marshall A, Batten S. Researching Across Cultures: Issues of Ethics and Power. FQS, Forum Qualitative Social Research 2004;5(3);39. http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fgs/article/view/572/1241 (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Médicins du Monde (Doctors of the World), Chauvin P, Mestre MC, Simonnot N. Access to Health Care for Vulnerable Groups in the European Union in 2012. An Overview of the Condition of Persons Excluded from Health Care Systems in the EU. Paris: Médicins du Monde, 2012.

http://www.doktersvandewereld.be/sites/www.doktersvandewereld.be/files/publicatie/attachments/eu_vulnerable_groups_2012_mdm.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Médicins du Monde (Doctors of the World), European Observatory on Access to Health Care, Chauvin P, Parizot I, Simonnot N. Access to Health Care for Undocumented Migrants in 11 European Countries. Paris: Médicins du Monde, 2009. . <u>http://mdmgreece.gr/attachments/283_huma%20en.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Mock-Muñoz de Luna C, Ingleby D, Graval E, Krasnik A. Synthesis Report. MEM-TP, Training packages for health professionals to improve access and quality of health services for migrants and ethnic minorities, including the Roma. Granada, Copenhague: Andalusian School of Public Health, University of Cophenhagen, 2015a. <u>http://www.mem-tp.org/pluginfile.php/619/mod_resource/content/1/MEM-TP_Synthesis_Report.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Mock-Muñoz de Luna C, Bodewes A, Graval E, Ingleby D. Appendices I-VI, Synthesis Repport. MEM-TP, Training packages for health professionals to improve access and quality of health services for migrants and ethnic minorities, including the Roma. Granada, Copenhagen: Andalusian School of Public Health, University of Copenhagen, 2015b.

http://www.mem-tp.org/pluginfile.php/620/mod_resource/content/1/MEM-TP_Synthesis_Report_Appendices_I-VI.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

NHS Greater Glasgow. Ethical Guidelines for Conducting Research with Minority Ethnic Communities. Glasgow: NHS Greater Glasgow, 2004.

Papadopoulos I (ed). Transcultural Health and Social Care: Development of Culturally Competent Practitioners. Churchill Livingstone Elsevier: Edinburgh, 2006, quoted in: IENE, Intercultural Education of Nurses in Europe, 2014, n.p.

http://www.ieneproject.eu/glossary-term.php?termID=11 (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Pechurina A. Positionality and Ethics in the Qualitative Research of Migrants' Homes. Sociological Research Online 2014;19(1):4:1-9.

PICUM, Platform for International Cooperation on Undocumented Migrants. Access to Health Care for undocumented Migrants in Europe: The Key Role of Local and Regional Authorities. Brussels: PICUM, 2014.

http://picum.org/picum.org/uploads/publication/PolicyBrief_Local%20and%20Regional%20Authorities_AccessHealthCare_UndocumentedMigrants_Oct.2014. pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Renschler I, Cattacin S. Comprehensive 'difference sensitivity' in health systems. In: Bjorngren-Cuadra C, Cattacin S (eds). Migration and Health: difference sensitivity from an organizational perspective, p. 37-41. Malmo: IMER, 2007.

Renzaho AMN, Romios P, Crock C, Sønderlund AL. The effectiveness of cultural competence programs in ethnic minority patient-centered health care – a systematic review of the literature. International Journal for Quality in Health Care 2013;25(3):261-269.

Robertson EV. "To be taken seriously": women's reflections on how migration and resettlement experiences influence their healthcare needs during childbearing in Sweden. Sexual & Reproductive Healthcare 2014 [in press].

Rosenfield S. Triple jeopardy? Mental health at the intersection of gender, race, and class. Social Science & Medicine 2012;74(11):1791-1801.

Ruiz-Casares M, Rousseau C, Derluyn I, Watters C, Crépeau F. Right and access to healthcare for undocumented children: Addressing the gap between international conventions and disparate implementations in North America and Europe. Social Science & Medicine 2010;70:329-336.

Sears KP. Improving cultural competence education: the utility of an intersectional framework. Medical Education 2012;46: 545-551.

Seng JS, Lopez WD, Sperlich M, Hamama L, Reed Meldrum CD. Marginalized identities, discrimination burden, and mental health: Empirical exploration of an interpersonal-level approach to modelling intersectionality. Social Science & Medicine 2012;75(12):2437-2445.

Suess A, Ruiz Pérez I, Ruiz Azarola A, March Cerdà JC. The right of access to health care for undocumented migrants: a revision of comparative analysis in the European context. European Journal of Public Health 2014;24(5):712-720. doi: 10.1093/eurpub/cku036.

UN, United Nations. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 [1969].

http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CERD.aspx (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

UN, United Nations. International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, 1990, n.p. <u>http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cmw/cmw.htm</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

UN, United Nations. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966 [1976].

http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CESCR.aspx (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

UNESCO, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. Intercultural Competences. Conceptual and Operational Framework. Paris: UNESCO, 2013. <u>http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002197/219768e.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

UNESCO, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity. Paris: UNESCO, 2001. <u>http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001271/127162e.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Van Laer K, Janssens M. Between the devil and the deep blue sea: Exploring the hybrid identity narratives of ethnic minority professionals. Scandinavian Journal of Management 2014;30(2):186-196.

Van Liempt I, Bilger V. The ethics of migration research methodology: dealing with vulnerable immigrants. Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2009. Viruell Fuentes EA, Miranda PY, Abdulrahim S. More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health. Social Science & Medicine 2012;75(12):2437-2445.

WHO, World Health Organization. Commission on Social Determinants of Health. Closing the gap in a generation. Health equity through action on the social determinants of health. Geneva: WHO, 2008. <u>http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2008/9789241563703_eng.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

WHO, World Health Organization. A conceptual framework for action on the social determinants of health. Discussion Paper Series on Social Determinants of Health 2. Geneva: WHO, 2010a. <u>http://www.who.int/sdhconference/resources/ConceptualframeworkforactiononSDH_eng.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

WHO, World Health Organization. How health systems can address health inequities linked to migration and ethnicity. Briefing on policy issues produced through the WHO/European Commission equity project. Copenhagen: WHO Regional Office for Europe, 2010b.

http://www.euro.who.int/__data/assets/pdf_file/0005/127526/e94497.pdf (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

WHO, World Health Organization. WHO's Contribution to the World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance. Health and freedom from discrimination. Health & Human Rights Publication Series Issue No. 2, Geneva: WHO, 2001.

<u>http://www.who.int/hhr/activities/q_and_a/en/Health_and_Freedom_from_Discrimination_English_699KB.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).

Wild V. Challenging bioethicists' agenda: The example of immigration, health care and ethics. Bioethics Forum 2011;4(2):64-65.

Woodward A, Howard N, Wolffers I. Health and access to care for undocumented migrants living in the European Union: a scoping review. Health Policy and Planning 2014;29:818-830.

World Health Assembly. WHA 61.17 Health of Migrants, 24 May 2008. <u>http://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/A61/A61_R17-en.pdf</u> (retrieved: March 5, 2015).



© European Union, 2015

For any reproduction of textual and multimedia information which are not under the © of the European Union, permission must be sought directly from the copyright holders.

© Cover Illustrations: Observatorio de la Infancia de Andalucía, Escuela Andaluza de Salud Pública. Junta de Andalucía.



Funded by the European Union in the framework of the EU Health Programme (2008-2013) in the frame of a service contract with the Consumer, Health, Agriculture and Food Executive Agency (Chafea) acting under the mandate from the European Commission. The content of this report represents the views of the Andalusian School of Public Health (EASP) and is its sole responsibility; it can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission and/or Chafea or any other body in the European Union. The European Commission and/or Chafea do not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this report, nor do they accept responsibility for any use made by third parties thereof.